# Wholesale Electricity Cost Modelling

Update of residential electricity price trends modelling for the Australian Energy Regulator

1 May 2019





## **Release Notice**

Ernst & Young was engaged on the instructions of the Australian Energy Regulator ("AER") to provide market modelling, consultancy and support services to inform the 2019 AER default market offer determination (the "Project") under an order for services to commence 11 March 2019 in accordance with a standing deed of offer for consultancy and business services.

The results of Ernst & Young's work, including the assumptions and qualifications made in preparing the report, are set out in Ernst & Young's report dated 1 May 2019 ("Report"). The Report should be read in its entirety including this release notice, the applicable scope of the work and any limitations. A reference to the Report includes any part of the Report. No further work has been undertaken by Ernst & Young since the date of the Report to update it.

Ernst & Young has prepared the Report for the benefit of the AER and has considered only the interests of the AER. Ernst & Young has not been engaged to act, and has not acted, as advisor to any other party. Accordingly, Ernst & Young makes no representations as to the appropriateness, accuracy or completeness of the Report for any other party's purposes. Our work commenced on 15 March 2019 and was completed on 5 April 2019. Therefore, our Report does not take account of events of circumstances arising after 5 April 2019 and we have no responsibility to update the Report for such events or circumstances.

No reliance may be placed upon the Report or any of its contents by any recipient of the Report for any purpose and any party receiving a copy of the Report must make and rely on their own enquiries in relation to the issues to which the Report relates, the contents of the Report and all matters arising from or relating to or in any way connected with the Report or its contents. Ernst & Young disclaims all responsibility to any other party for any loss or liability that the other party may suffer or incur arising from or relating to or in any way connected with the contents of the Report, the provision of the Report to the other party or the reliance upon the Report by the other party.

No claim or demand or any actions or proceedings may be brought against Ernst & Young arising from or connected with the contents of the Report or the provision of the Report to any party. Ernst & Young will be released and forever discharged from any such claims, demands, actions or proceedings. Our Report is based, in part, on the information provided to us by the AER. We have relied on the accuracy of the information gathered through these sources. We do not imply, and it should not be construed that we have performed audit or due diligence procedures on any of the information provided to us. We have not independently verified, or accept any responsibility or liability for independently verifying, any such information nor do we make any representation as to the accuracy or completeness of the information. We accept no liability for any loss or damage, which may result from your reliance on any research, analyses or information so supplied.

Modelling work performed as part of our scope inherently requires assumptions about future behaviours and market interactions, which may result in forecasts that deviate from future conditions. There will usually be differences between estimated and actual outcomes, because events and circumstances frequently do not occur as expected, and those differences may be material. We take no responsibility that the projected outcomes will be achieved. We highlight that our analysis and Report do not constitute investment advice or a recommendation to you on a future course of action. We provide no assurance that the scenarios we have modelled will be accepted by any relevant authority or third party.

Ernst & Young have consented to the Report being published electronically on the AER website for informational purposes only. Ernst & Young have not consented to distribution or disclosure beyond this. The material contained in the Report, including the Ernst & Young logo, is copyright and copyright in the Report itself vests in the AER. The Report, including the Ernst & Young logo, cannot be altered without prior written permission from Ernst & Young.

Ernst & Young's liability is limited by a scheme approved under Professional Standards Legislation.



## 1. Update of wholesale cost modelling

This report presents a minor update to the modelling and calculations that EY prepared for the AEMC informing the AEMC 2018 Residential Electricity Price Trends report (the "AEMC Report")<sup>1</sup>. The AER instructed us to:

- Apply the identical methodology and modelling assumptions applied in the AEMC Report
- But update the projected wholesale electricity cost component for representative residential customer demand profiles (Net System Load Profile) across various jurisdictional areas (QLD, NSW and SA) in the NEM by applying the newly available daily prices of the ASX energy futures since the work concluded for the AEMC Report.

Only the electricity component of the wholesale electricity cost has been reviewed for this report. The analysis presented in this report essentially provides an update to section 5.3 of the AEMC Report only. No further work or updates have been assessed relating to other components of wholesale cost such as renewable policy costs, ancillary services costs, market fees, etc. No other changes to the wholesale electricity market modelling or calculations were made to consider other possible or actual market developments other than the ASX energy futures data set.

This report should be read in conjunction with our report to the AEMC<sup>1</sup>, which is publicly available, as this report does not present the detailed methodology and modelling assumptions applied in the AEMC Report.

#### 1.1 Methodology

A gradient descent method was used to optimise the retail hedge portfolio that is constructed with standard contract types including base swap, peak swap and \$300/MWh cap contracts. The optimisation is based on inputs of the forecast demand, the calculated strike prices and the simulated wholesale spot market prices. The outcome of the gradient descent optimisation provides a relative level of hedging to target a consistent weekly electricity cost for each representative customer load jurisdiction. A detailed description of the methodology and the background materials can be found in the AEMC Report.

#### 1.2 Contract strike price

The prices of the ASX energy futures for the base swap, peak swap and cap contracts in three regions (QLD, NSW and SA) were updated to 31 March 2019<sup>2</sup>, incorporating the latest prices in the last six months. Note that the strike prices in the AEMC Report were estimated based on ASX energy futures data up to 15 October 2018. The contract strike prices were then calculated by weighting the average monthly ASX energy futures settlement prices based on an exponential hedging procurement strategy with a 24 or 12 month procured period.

The updated strike prices for the 24-month hedge book build approach are shown in Figure 1<sup>3</sup>. Compared with the AEMC Report data set, in financial year 2018-19 the strike prices are not affected as the assumed procurement strategy is based on a book build up to 2 months prior to the delivery period. In some quarters of the financial year 2019-20 the base and peak strike prices have become considerably higher, more than \$20/MWh higher in some cases. The cap strike prices

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> EY - 2018 Residential Electricity Price Trends - Wholesale Market Costs Modelling. Available <u>https://www.aemc.gov.au/market-reviews-advice/residential-electricity-price-trends-2018</u> as at 24 April 2019.
<sup>2</sup> <u>https://www.asxenergy.com.au/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> EY produced chart based on analysis of ASX energy futures daily closing price data



have also generally increased for the third quarter (summer). The higher strike prices are due to the continued increase of the ASX energy futures prices over the last six months.

Strike prices from the 12 month hedge book build approach are shown in Figure 2<sup>3</sup>. Generally, the trends of the change in the base, peak and cap strike prices are similar to those in the 24 month hedging. However, there is a larger increase in the prices in some quarters. As explained previously, there is an increasing trend in the contract prices in the last half year. The 12 month hedging strategy applies a higher weighting to more recent ASX prices and thus, compared with the results in the 24 month hedging, has a stronger increase in the strike prices compared to the AEMC Report.

Figure 1: Strike prices of the base swap, peak swap and cap contracts in QLD, NSW and SA before and after the update (24 month exponential hedging strategy)



Figure 2: Strike prices of the base swap, peak swap and cap contracts in QLD, NSW and SA before and after the update (12 month exponential hedging strategy)





## 1.3 Wholesale electricity cost

Wholesale electricity costs for financial years 2018-19 and 2019-20 in three regions, QLD, NSW and SA, have been calculated based on updated strike prices (as outlined in the previous section) applied with the forecast demand and wholesale market spot prices from the AEMC Report work. Costs from two exponential hedging strategies with a procurement period of 24 and 12 months, respectively, are compared with the corresponding results in the AEMC Report.

Figures 3 and 4 show the wholesale electricity costs from different scenarios calculated with the 24 and 12 month exponential hedging strategies, respectively. Results from the two hedge strategies are quite similar as the strike prices are very close to each other in both strategies. The price variations between different scenarios are generally small, less than \$10/MWh, since in this case the wholesale market spot prices are not sensitive to the demand and fuel changes. Results from the base scenario before the update are also included for comparison. In financial year 2018-19, the costs are not changed. In financial year 2019-20, there is an increase in the costs between \$10/MWh and \$20/MWh in all jurisdictional areas. This is because in this financial year the updated strike prices are higher and the cost changes are reflective of the strike price changes.

The wholesale electricity costs shown in Figures 3 and 4 from the base scenario in financial years 2018-19 and 2019-20 are listed in Table 1. The update does not affect the wholesale electricity costs in financial year 2018-19 so the wholesale electricity costs in financial year 2018-19 before and after the update are only presented in one column.









#### Figure 4: Wholesale electricity costs for QLD, NSW and SA from the 12 month exponential hedging strategy

Table 1: Wholesale electricity costs (base scenario) for jurisdictional areas in QLD, NSW and SA from the 24 and 12 month exponential hedging strategies

Jurisdictional area	24 month			12 month		
	2018-19 (AEMC Report)	2019-20 (AEMC Report)	2019-20 (Base updated)	2018-19 (AEMC Report)	2019-20 (AEMC Report)	2019-20 (Base updated)
Energex	\$83.55	\$60.78	\$72.40	\$82.29	\$57.76	\$73.86
Essential	\$100.89	\$83.02	\$91.22	\$101.01	\$81.82	\$93.33
Endeavour	\$108.12	\$90.31	\$102.57	\$108.21	\$88.28	\$105.88
Ausgrid	\$108.98	\$90.28	\$99.04	\$109.07	\$88.98	\$101.57
SAPN	\$149.00	\$128.04	\$137.30	\$150.12	\$128.34	\$141.80

#### EY | Assurance | Tax | Transactions | Advisory

#### About EY

EY is a global leader in assurance, tax, transaction and advisory services. The insights and quality services we deliver help build trust and confidence in the capital markets and in economies the world over. We develop outstanding leaders who team to deliver on our promises to all of our stakeholders. In so doing, we play a critical role in building a better working world for our people, for our clients and for our communities.

EY refers to the global organisation and may refer to one or more of the member firms of Ernst & Young Global Limited, each of which is a separate legal entity. Ernst & Young Global Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, does not provide services to clients. For more information about our organisation, please visit ey.com.

© 2019 Ernst & Young, Australia All Rights Reserved.

Ernst & Young is a registered trademark. Our report may be relied upon by Australian Energy Regulator for the purpose of assisting in the preparation of their 2019 Default Market Offer determination only. We disclaim all responsibility to any other party for any loss or liability that the other party may suffer or incur arising from or relating to or in any way connected with the contents of our report, the provision of our report to the other party or the reliance upon our report by the other party.

Liability limited by a scheme approved under Professional Standards Legislation.

ey.com