



**FINAL DECISION**  
**Endeavour Energy**  
**Distribution Determination**

**2019 to 2024**

**Attachment 9**  
**Capital expenditure sharing**  
**scheme**

April 2019

© Commonwealth of Australia 2019

This work is copyright. In addition to any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, all material contained within this work is provided under a Creative Commons Attributions 3.0 Australia licence, with the exception of:

- the Commonwealth Coat of Arms
- the ACCC and AER logos
- any illustration, diagram, photograph or graphic over which the Australian Competition and Consumer Commission does not hold copyright, but which may be part of or contained within this publication. The details of the relevant licence conditions are available on the Creative Commons website, as is the full legal code for the CC BY 3.0 AU licence.

Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to the:

Director, Corporate Communications  
Australian Competition and Consumer Commission  
GPO Box 4141, Canberra ACT 2601

or [publishing.unit@acc.gov.au](mailto:publishing.unit@acc.gov.au).

Inquiries about this publication should be addressed to:

Australian Energy Regulator  
GPO Box 520  
Melbourne Vic 3001

Tel: 1300 585 165

Email: [AERInquiry@aer.gov.au](mailto:AERInquiry@aer.gov.au)

## Note

This attachment forms part of the AER's final decision on the distribution determination that will apply to Endeavour Energy for the 2019-2024 regulatory control period. It should be read with all other parts of the final decision.

As a number of issues were settled at the draft decision stage or required only minor updates, we have not prepared all attachments. The attachments have been numbered consistently with the equivalent attachments to our longer draft decision. In these circumstances, our draft decision reasons form part of this final decision.

The final decision includes the following attachments:

### Overview

Attachment 1 – Annual revenue requirement

Attachment 2 – Regulatory asset base

Attachment 4 – Regulatory depreciation

Attachment 5 – Capital expenditure

Attachment 6 – Operating expenditure

Attachment 7 – Corporate income tax

Attachment 9 – Capital expenditure sharing scheme

Attachment 10 – Service target performance incentive scheme

Attachment 12 – Classification of services

Attachment 13 – Control mechanisms

Attachment 15 – Alternative control services

Attachment 18 – Tariff structure statement

Attachment A – Negotiating framework

# Contents

<b>Note</b> .....	<b>9-2</b>
<b>Contents</b> .....	<b>9-3</b>
<b>Shortened forms</b> .....	<b>9-4</b>
<b>9 Capital expenditure sharing scheme</b> .....	<b>9-5</b>
<b>9.1 Final decision</b> .....	<b>9-5</b>
<b>9.2 Endeavour Energy's revised proposal</b> .....	<b>9-6</b>
<b>9.3 Assessment approach</b> .....	<b>9-6</b>
9.3.1 Interrelationships.....	9-7
<b>9.4 Reasons for final decision</b> .....	<b>9-8</b>
9.4.1 CESS revenue increments from the 2014–19 regulatory control period .....	9-8
9.4.2 Application of the CESS for the 2019–24 regulatory control period	9-8

## Shortened forms

Shortened form	Extended form
CESS	Capital expenditure sharing scheme
DNSP	Distribution network service provider
RAB	regulatory asset base
AER	Australian Energy Regulator
NER	National Electricity Rules
EBSS	Efficiency benefit sharing scheme
STPIS	Service target performance incentive scheme
WACC	Weighted average cost of capital
PTRM	Post tax revenue model
CPI	Consumer Price Index
RFM	Roll forward model
NPV	Net present value

## 9 Capital expenditure sharing scheme

The capital expenditure sharing scheme (CESS) provides additional financial rewards to those distribution network service providers (DNSPs) that improve capex efficiency and additional financial penalties for those that become less efficient. Consumers benefit from improved efficiency through a lower RAB which results in lower regulated revenues.

The CESS approximates efficiency gains and efficiency losses by calculating the difference between approved forecast and actual capex. It shares these gains or losses between DNSPs and consumers. Under the CESS, a DNSP retains 30 per cent of an under-spend or over-spend. This means that for a one dollar saving in capex, the DNSP keeps 30 cents of the benefit while consumers keep 70 cents of the benefit.

The CESS works as follows:

1. We calculate the cumulative efficiency gains or losses for the current regulatory period in net present value terms.
2. We apply a ratio of 30 per cent to the cumulative under-spend or over-spend to work out what the service provider's share of the under-spend or over-spend should be.
3. We calculate the CESS payments taking into account the financing benefit or cost to the service provider of the under-spends or over-spends.<sup>1</sup> We can also make further adjustments to account for deferral of capex and ex post exclusions of capex from the RAB.<sup>2</sup>
4. The CESS payments will be added to or subtracted from the service provider's regulated revenue as a separate building block in the next regulatory control period.

This attachment sets out our final decision for the determination of the revenue increments or decrements as a result of the CESS applying from the 2014–19 regulatory control period and the application of the CESS for Endeavour in the 2019–24 regulatory control period.

### 9.1 Final decision

Our final decision is to approve a CESS revenue increment of \$6.95 million (\$2018–19) from the application of the CESS in the 2014–19 regulatory control period.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> We calculate benefits as the benefits to the service provider of financing the under-spend since the amount of the under-spend can be put to some other income generating use during the period. Losses are similarly calculated as the financing cost to the service provider of the over-spend.

<sup>2</sup> The capex incentive guideline outlines how we may exclude capex from the RAB and adjust the CESS payment for deferrals. AER, *Capital Expenditure Incentive Guideline for Electricity Network Service Providers*, November 2013, pp. 9, 13–20.

<sup>3</sup> The CESS does not apply to 2014–15. NER, clause 11.56.3(a)(3).

The difference between our calculations and Endeavour's proposal is due to updated inflation and discount rates.

Our final decision on the revenue impact of the application of the CESS in the 2014–19 regulatory control period compared to Endeavour's revised proposal is summarised in Table 1 below.

**Table 1 AER's final decision on Endeavour's CESS revenue increment (\$ million, 2018–19)**

	2019–20	2020–21	2021–22	2022–23	2023–24	Total
Endeavour's revised proposal	1.41	1.41	1.41	1.41	1.41	7.05
AER final decision	1.39	1.39	1.39	1.39	1.39	6.95

## 9.2 Endeavour Energy's revised proposal

Endeavour accepted our draft decision methodology and updated 2017–18 capex to reflect actual capex. Endeavour noted that this reduced its draft decision CESS benefit from \$12.3 million to \$7.0 million.<sup>4</sup>

## 9.3 Assessment approach

Under the National Electricity Rules (NER) we must decide:

- the revenue effects on Endeavour arising from applying the CESS in the 2014–19 regulatory control period<sup>5</sup>; and
- whether or not to apply the CESS to Endeavour in the 2019–24 regulatory control period and how any applicable scheme will apply.<sup>6</sup>

Our assessment approach is set out below.

We must determine the appropriate revenue increments or decrements (if any) for each year of the 2019–24 regulatory control period arising from the application of the CESS during the 2014–19 regulatory control period.<sup>7</sup>

The NER require that our final decision include a determination on how any applicable CESS is to apply to Endeavour.<sup>8</sup>

<sup>4</sup> Endeavour, Revised proposal, January 2019, p. 23.

<sup>5</sup> NER, cl. 6.4.3(a)(5).

<sup>6</sup> NER cl. 6.3.2(a)(3); 6.12.1(9).

<sup>7</sup> NER cl. 6.4.3(a)(5). Transitional arrangements in the NER excludes 2014–15.

<sup>8</sup> NER cl. 6.3.2(a)(3); 6.12.1(9).

In deciding whether to apply a CESS to Endeavour for the 2019–24 regulatory control period, and the nature of the details of the scheme, we must:

- make that decision in a manner that contributes to the capex incentive objective<sup>9</sup>
- take into account the CESS principles<sup>10</sup>, the capex objectives<sup>11</sup>, other incentive schemes<sup>12</sup>, and, where relevant the opex objectives<sup>13</sup>, as they apply to the particular service provider, and the circumstances of the service provider.

The capex incentive objective is to ensure that only capex that meets the capex criteria enters the RAB used to set prices. Therefore, consumers only fund capex that is efficient and prudent.

### 9.3.1 Interrelationships

The approval of CESS payments/penalties determines the associated CESS building block and therefore Endeavour's overall forecast revenue requirement for the 2019–24 regulatory control period.

As set out in the AER's capex incentive guidelines, without applying a CESS for the 2019–24 regulatory control period, Endeavour will face incentives that decline over the period.

That is, if Endeavour makes an efficiency gain in the first year of the 2019–24 regulatory control period, any benefit will last for four more years before the RAB is updated for actual capex. In the final year however, the benefit will be approximately zero. This may lead to inefficient capex and inefficient substitution of opex for capex towards the end of a regulatory control period.<sup>14</sup>

The CESS relates to other incentives Endeavour faces to incur efficient opex, conduct demand management and maintain or improve service levels. Related schemes are the efficiency benefit sharing scheme (EBSS) for opex, the service target performance incentive scheme (STPIS) for service levels and the demand management incentive scheme and innovation allowance mechanism for non-network options relating to demand management. The AER aims to incentivise network service providers to make efficient decisions on when and what type of expenditure to incur and to balance expenditure efficiencies with service quality. We discuss these interrelationships where relevant as part of our expenditure attachments.

---

<sup>9</sup> NER, cl. 6.5.8A(e)(3); the capex criteria are set out in cl. 6.5.7(c)(1)-(3) of the NER.

<sup>10</sup> NER, cl. 6.5.8A(e)(4)(i).

<sup>11</sup> NER, cll. 6.5.7(a); 6.5.8A(d)(2).

<sup>12</sup> NER, cl. 6.5.8A(d)(1).

<sup>13</sup> NER, cl. 6.5.8A(d)(2).

<sup>14</sup> AER, *Capital Expenditure Incentive Guideline for Electricity Network Service Providers*, November 2013, p. 5.



## 9.4 Reasons for final decision

### 9.4.1 CESS revenue increments from the 2014–19 regulatory control period

We consider Endeavour should receive a net CESS payment of \$6.95 million (\$2018–19) from the application of version one of the CESS during the 2014–19 regulatory control period across its distribution and transmission networks. We note that the scheme operates only over the 2015–16, 2016–17, 2017–18 and 2018–19 regulatory years. This is because the 2014–15 transitional year of the determination was excluded when version one of the CESS was applied.<sup>15</sup>

Endeavour has accepted our draft decision amendments to the CESS model and has updated their forecast capex to reflect actual capex 2017–18. We have also updated the model to reflect actual CPI data for 2017–18. This results in a \$0.1 million decrease relative to Endeavour's revised proposal.

### 9.4.2 Application of the CESS for the 2019–24 regulatory control period

The reasons for our preference for a CESS are set out in our capital expenditure incentive guideline.<sup>16</sup> In developing the guideline, we took into account the capex incentive objective, capex criteria, capex objectives and the National Electricity Objective.

We will apply version one of the CESS,<sup>17</sup> with the updated formulae set out in the TransGrid final determination,<sup>18</sup> to Endeavour in the 2019–24 regulatory control period. As we have set out in the framework and approach, we consider this provides Endeavour with a continuous incentive to pursue efficiency gains. This approach is consistent with Endeavour's regulatory proposal.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> NER, cl. 11.56.3(a)(3).

<sup>16</sup> AER, *Capital Expenditure Incentive Guideline for Electricity Network Service Providers*, November 2013,

<sup>17</sup> AER, *Capital Expenditure Incentive Guideline for Electricity Network Service Providers*, November 2013,

<sup>18</sup> AER, *Final decision TransGrid transmission determination 2018 to 2023, Attachment 10 – Capital expenditure sharing scheme*, May 2018.

<sup>19</sup> Endeavour Energy, *Regulatory Proposal 1 July 2019 to 30 June 2024*, April 2018, p. 92.